

Planning and Orders Committee

Minutes of the virtual meeting held on 7 October 2020

- PRESENT:** Councillor Richard Owain Jones (Vice-Chair)
- Councillors John Griffith, Glyn Haynes, T LI Hughes MBE, K P Hughes, Vaughan Hughes, Eric Wyn Jones, Dafydd Roberts and Robin Williams.
- Councillor Richard A Dew – Portfolio Holder (Planning).
- IN ATTENDANCE:** Development Management Manager (NJ), Senior Planning Officer (GJ), Legal Services Manager (RJ), Committee Officer (MEH).
- APOLOGIES:** Councillor Nicola Roberts.
- ALSO PRESENT:** Local Members : Councillors Llinos M Huws, Aled M Jones, Bryan Owen, Margaret M Roberts, Dafydd R Thomas.
-

1 APOLOGIES

As noted above.

2 DECLARATION OF INTEREST

Councillor John Griffith declared a personal interest in respect of application 12.7 – Coleg Menai, Llangefni.

Councillor K P Hughes declared a personal interest in respect of application 12.7 – Coleg Menai, Llangefni.

3 MINUTES

The minutes of the previous meeting of the Planning and Orders Committee held on 2 September, 2020 were confirmed as correct.

4 SITE VISITS

None convened.

5 PUBLIC SPEAKING

There were representations forwarded as regards to applications 12.3 and 12.6 and were read out at this meeting of the Planning and Orders Committee.

6 APPLICATIONS THAT WILL BE DEFERRED

None were considered by this meeting of the Planning and Orders Committee.

7 APPLICATIONS ARISING

7.1 19C1231 – Outline application for the erection of 32 market dwellings and 4 affordable dwellings, construction of new vehicular and pedestrian access, provision of play area and open spaces together with full details of access and layout on land adjacent to Cae Rhos Estate, Porthdafarch Road, Holyhead

The application was presented to the Planning and Orders Committee as an addendum to the Transport Assessment has been submitted which proposes that a Traffic Regulation Order for a one-way street requiring that vehicles are only permitted to travel in a northerly direction along Porthdafarch Road from the junction of Arthur Street to the junction with the B4545 Kingsland Road and is currently being consulted and publicised as part of the application. The date for the consultation period comes to an end on 8 October, 2020. The recommendation is of deferment of the application to allow the Highways Authority to respond and to receive any public representations as regards to the proposal.

It was RESOLVED to defer the application for the reasons given.

8 ECONOMIC APPLICATIONS

None were considered by this meeting of the Planning and Orders Committee.

9 AFFORDABLE HOUSING APPLICATIONS

None were considered by this meeting of the Planning and Orders Committee.

10 DEPARTURE APPLICATIONS

None were considered by this meeting of the Planning and Orders Committee.

11 DEVELOPMENT PROPOSALS SUBMITTED BY COUNCILLORS AND OFFICERS

None were considered by this meeting of the Planning and Orders Committee.

12 REMAINDER OF APPLICATIONS

12.1 FPL/2019/217 – Full application for the erection of 17 affordable dwellings, construction of two new vehicular and 3 new agricultural accesses, installation of a pumping station together with soft and hard landscaping on land adjacent to Craig y Don Estate and Cherry Tree Close, Benllech

The application was presented to the Planning and Orders Committee at the request of Local Members.

The Development Management Manager reported that an application has been made to Welsh Government to call-in the application. She further said that correspondence was received by Officer's from Welsh Government prohibiting the Local Authority from approving the application so as to allow discussion as to whether to forward the proposal for decision by the Welsh Government Ministers. The recommendation therefore to defer the application.

It was RESOLVED to defer the application for the reasons given.

12.2 DEM/2020/4 – Application to determine whether prior approval is required for the demolition of the former school at Newborough Primary School, Newborough

The application was presented to the Planning and Orders Committee as the application is submitted by the Council on council owned land.

The Development Management Manager reported that the application is made for the demolition of the former Newborough Primary School which is now closed. She said that the Local Planning Authority has 28 days to respond to ecological information the Committee was requested to afford power to act to the Officer's to approve the application following receipt of ecological information.

Councillor Robin Williams proposed that the application be approved and Councillor Vaughan Hughes seconded the proposal.

It was RESOLVED to approve the application in accordance with the Officer's recommendation subject to the conditions listed within the written report and subject to receipt of ecological information.

12.3 47C151B – Full application for the erection of six 5 meter high floodlights for the manege at Ty'n Ffordd, Elim, Llanddeusant

The application was presented to the Planning and Orders Committee at the request of a Local Member.

It was reported that a letter was received by Ms Paula Bond, in opposition to the application. The letter was read out to the meeting as follows:-

'To those of you who have not had the opportunity to visit Elim and the applicant's residence Tyn Ffordd, I thought it might be helpful to describe our hamlet of Elim. Elim was renamed after a biblical reference to the place where the Israelites camped near to wells and date trees – a perfect place. To enter Elim, you need to cross a stone bridge which runs over the Afron Alaw. Elim is very small, it has no public services, shops or indeed transport links. Most of the cottages date to 1800's and possibly earlier. There is a single-track road through the hamlet that has no road markings. It is used primarily by residents and farm vehicles as we are surrounded by farmland.

Tyn Ffordd is in the middle of Elim and is surrounded on three sides by residential buildings. It was originally a small holding consisting of a cottage, outbuildings and six acres of fields. Now in addition it has two static caravans with space for three, stable block for 8 horses, garage, barn, parking for 10 cars and of course the professionally built ménage which measures 25m x 40m. This ménage runs alongside our cottage right next to the shared boundary at Tyddyn Garol. Tyddyn Garol is a very old traditionally built one storey stone cottage with the original inglenook fireplace and the original scullery fire and basin still intact. The deeds of this cottage dates to 1825 but according to a resident of the village whose ancestors grew up in Elim, it is probably much older than that.

The proposed plan to allow six five metre floodlights to be erected around the ménage is objected on several reasons which I will summarise as following;

1. Not in keeping with the unspoilt beauty of Elim – This was also the view of Tref Alaw Parish council. There cannot be many hamlets on Ynys Mon that have managed to maintain their original character, size and charm.
2. Light Pollution to Elim and Tyddyn Garol – Six metre floodlights are acceptable on a football field or sports arena; both are normally built in a non-residential area or close to a town or city. There are no floodlit ménages on Ynys Mon that have been granted planning permission that sit in the middle of a hamlet and so close to private dwellings.
3. Right to privacy and enjoyment of property- Since this dreadful pandemic, Tyddyn Garol is now host to three generations of one family. My mother in law, 78 years old and who is classed by the Welsh Government as very vulnerable, is living with us along with our daughter. The bedrooms at Tyddyn Garol are the nearest to the boundary of the Ménage and the floodlights will shine directly into them. My mother in law has numerous health conditions. The turning on of these floodlights, shining into her bedroom would cause her distress which we feel is avoidable when weighing right to live and enjoy our property with the right to enjoy a hobby. It is of course an infringement of privacy as the floodlights will light up the area, primarily of course the bedrooms.
4. Dark Skies Ynys Mon is already gaining good ground as a great place to star gaze. Here is a quote from Dark Skies to explain how important it is to stargazing not to have artificial light pollution.

“Spoiling our views of the heavens”- The effects of light pollution on how we see the night-time skies is dramatic. From a light polluted town or city, it’s possible to see perhaps 200 stars however from a dark sky site it’s possible to see as many as 3000 stars without any visual aid on a moonless night. You can often readily see the effects of light pollution yourself, on some nights the skies glow orange caused by the inefficient sodium-vapour street- lights illuminating the clouds above. On clear nights that light dilutes the skies meaning starlight is washed out and less stars being visible.

5. The property at Tyn Ffordd has recently been sold (Subject to contract) – The initial planning application was to erect six 5 metre floodlights on the ménage so the applicant could ride in the evenings after work and not have to go on the lanes surrounding the village and its use would solely be for private use and family and friends. Surely this is a moot point if the original reason for the application is no longer a fact as the applicant is moving to another area for pastures new?

In conclusion, I would urge you to look at the photos in our original objection, showing the closeness of this ménage to our cottage and the fact that it is only five metres from our bedroom windows. The unfortunate consequences for Tyddyn Garol and Elim is a high risk of light pollution. This is contrary to the report’s finding, compiled by the manufactures of the Floodlights. If I may, I must remind you this report was completed without a site visit taking place and did not taken into account that Tyddyn Garol is at a much lower level than the ménage which I am reliably informed will skew the report’s findings and conclusions. I urge you to consider the points above when discussing this application and the impact it will have on the hamlet and of course, our lives. Tyddyn Garol and Elim is our forever home and we feel we have a duty to protect its history and character.’

The Development Management Manager reported that the proposed development is for the erection of six 5 metre floodlights to the existing manege. The purpose of the proposed floodlights is to enable the continued use of the manege during the winter months between the hours of 5.00 p.m. and 8.00 p.m. between 1 November and the end of February.

Councillor John Griffith said that the small village of Elim is a rural area with very narrow highways network. He considered that the application to erect floodlights on the proposed site is inappropriate as a condition was placed on the approval of an application to create a manege on site in 2017 which stated that no external lighting should be used for the manege. Councillor Griffith referred to the comments within the report as regards to effect on dark skies and the need for a condition that the floodlights will at all times points towards the manege with measures implemented to prevent overspill. He raised as to how these conditions are to be monitored and adhered to as the dwelling has been recently sold. He considered that the proposed application would have a detrimental effect on the amenities of the residents

and dark skies and proposed that the application be refused contrary to the Officer's recommendation. Councillor K P Hughes agreed with the comments made by Councillor Griffiths and expressed that the property is near other dwellings in the village. Councillor Hughes seconded the proposal of refusal of the application.

The Development Management Manager reported that the application has been submitted to the Planning Authority for a considerable period and the Planning Officer has been communicating with the applicant as regards to the purpose of the requirement for floodlighting and appropriate conditions has been attached to any approval of the application. She referred to the matter raised as to how the conditions will be monitored and adhered to; the Officer said that it was considered that local residents would report any breach of conditions to the local authority. The Development Management Manager further said that the manege is for private use only and it would allow the resident to exercise their horse's safety and not having to ride on the narrow lanes.

Councillor Eric W Jones proposed that the application be approved in accordance with the Officer's recommendation. Councillor R O Jones seconded the proposal.

Following the vote:-

It was RESOLVED to refuse the application contrary to the Officer's recommendation due to the effect on the amenities of the local residents and the detrimental effect on dark skies.

(In accordance with the requirements of the Council's Constitution, the application was automatically deferred to the next meeting to allow Officers the opportunity to prepare a report in respect of the reasons given for approving the application).

12.4 FPL/2020/92 – Full application for the creation of 2 parking spaces at 3 Bronallt, Cambria Road, Menai Bridge

The application was presented to the Planning and Orders Committee at the request of a Local Member.

Councillor Robin Williams, and a Local Member requested that the Committee visit the site as he considered it would be beneficial for the Members to view the site as he was of the opinion that such an application would place an unacceptable precedent not only in respect of this application but in other part of the Island.

It was RESOLVED to visit the site at the request of a Local Member.

12.5 FPL/2020/45 – Full application to increase the number of touring caravans (an extra 23) from 15 to 38 on the site at Talli Ho, Prys Iorwerth Uchaf, Bethel, Bodorgan

The application was presented to the Planning and Orders Committee by a Local Member.

The Development Management Manager reported that the application is a full application to increase the number of touring caravans from 15 to 38 together with the erection of a new toilet block and landscaping works. The applicant has agreed to plant further trees and hedges on the South and South East boundary to ensure that the further improvements is made to the landscaping of the site and provides biodiversity enhancement. She noted that letters of objection to the application have been received and were noted within the Officer's report. The application conforms to Planning Policy TWR 5 and the recommendation is of approval of the application.

Councillor Dafydd Roberts said that there has been a considerable increase in the provision of tourist facilities in the area over the last 3 to 4 years. He referred to strategic planning policy 5 which promotes sustainable development and economic diversification. He further said that it has shown this year that tourist facilities such beaches and tourist attractions have been unable to facilitate the amount of people in the area with cars parked on the public highways; the infrastructure is unable to cope. Councillor Roberts further expressed that he did not consider that these facilities contribute to the local economy with residents having to pay to upgrade resources for tourism. The Development Management Manager responded that each application must be dealt with planning policies in place to deal with such applications. Policy TWR 5 ensure that the location of the sites is sustainable for such a development and the policy promote that development are located on main roads to ensure highway safety with traffic entering and leaving the site. She referred that the application has been assessed in accordance with current planning policies and the recommendation is of approval.

Councillor Dafydd Roberts proposed that the application be refused contrary to the recommendation of the Officer's as there are over development of caravan sites in the area and is contrary to the principles of sustainable development. Councillor John Griffiths seconded the proposal of refusal of the application.

Councillor K P Hughes said that the Island is dependent on tourism and agriculture and it brings necessary resources to the local economy. Councillor K P Hughes proposed approval of the application. Councillor Eric Jones seconded the proposal.

Following the vote :-

It was RESOLVED to refuse the application contrary to the Officer's recommendation due the over development of caravan sites in the area and being contrary to the principles of sustainable development.

(In accordance with the requirements of the Council's Constitution, the application was automatically deferred to the next meeting to allow

Officers the opportunity to prepare a report in respect of the reasons given for approving the application).

12.6 HHP/2020/168 – Full application for the demolition of the outbuilding and erection of an annexe at Tyn Lon, Llaneilian

The application was presented to the Planning and Orders Committee at the request of a Local Member.

It was reported that a letter was received by the Llaneilian Community Council, opposing the application. The letter was read out to the meeting as follows:-

‘At the Llaneilian Community Council meeting on 8th September 2020 the proposed development at Tyn Lon, Llaneilian was discussed. The Community Council’s understanding is that the proposal is to demolish a corrugated iron Dutch barn and build an annexe located within the garden of the residential property known as Tyn Lon.

Developments of this type are often called ‘Granny Annexes’. The Community Council are not opposed in principle to sensitively designed extensions / annexes that provide ancillary accommodation and enable families to make appropriate arrangements to care for elderly relatives or allow younger family members to remain in the family home. However, Llaneilian Community Council object to the current development proposals on the following grounds:

Alignment with JLDP

The Community Council note that whilst the Joint Local Development Plan makes no specific reference to ‘annexes’ the site is located outwith any development boundary, in the open countryside and within Anglesey’s Area of Outstanding Natural Beauty (AONB). Proposals in the AONB require developments to ‘maintain or enhance natural beauty’. The Joint Local Development Plan sets out a strategic approach, concentrating development within agreed boundaries where services are available. Penysarn is identified as a village towards which development should be directed. Penysarn has a shop / post office, primary school, chapel, village hall and a regular bus service to Amlwch and Bangor. However the proposed site lies well outside the village boundary, in open countryside, and does not have easy access to these facilities other than by car. The Joint Local Development Plan states that new development in the countryside ‘are subject to more control and are mainly restricted to developments which require a location in the countryside or that meet a local rural need, support rural diversification or sustainability of the countryside’. Furthermore, the JLDP continues ‘this policy acknowledges that some types of development are necessary if the plan is to address the area’s social, economic or environmental needs’. It is the Community Council’s view that there is no evidence in the information that has been received that the proposal relates to any of these types of development. The plans as submitted show a single storey building comprising an entrance hall, utility room, combined kitchen / dining area / lounge, 2 bedrooms and a

shower room. The internal floor area is similar to the average UK dwelling (85sqM). Additional parking for a single vehicle is indicated.

Subservience (Use and Scale)

Whilst the description of the development describes the proposal as an annexe there are no further details as to the proposed use of the annexe to clarify the dependence with the main property. It is the Community Council's view that due to the level of accommodation proposed the development is capable of providing an independent self-contained unit of accommodation with no reliance on the main dwelling. The development would in effect amount to a separate self-contained dwelling, not a residential annexe having a degree of dependence on the main dwelling.

Design and Visual

From the lane the proposed annexe would be perceived by members of the public as a separate new dwelling. The Community Council are of the view that:

- the chosen location on the site does not minimise the visual impact;
- the style of building does not harmonise well with the existing residence;
- the materials currently proposed accentuate the annexe in the environment rather than helping to make the building visually subservient.

The Community Council consider the design and visual aspects of the proposed annexe to be unacceptable.

Sustainability

The Joint Local Development Plan promotes sustainable development in rural areas and discourages new isolated homes in the countryside. The site does not have a high level of accessibility and, as stated above, future residents are likely to be dependent on the private car to access services and facilities.

Use beyond immediate need for annexe accommodation

No evidence for the need for annexe accommodation, rather than an extension to the current building, has been received by the Community Council. There is also no indication of how the accommodation will be incorporated within the main dwelling when no longer needed as an annexe,

In conclusion, the proposed site is located in the open countryside and well outside the settlements of Penysarn and Amlwch. The development is contrary to the Planning Authorities sustainability policy. There is sufficient supply of deliverable housing land available within the boundary of Llanelian Community Council at Penysarn. If despite the Community Council's views the Planning Committee agree the proposed development then the Community Council request the inclusion of the following planning condition. "The building hereby permitted shall not be occupied at any time other than for purposes ancillary to the residential use of the dwelling known as Tyn Lon."

It was reported that a letter was received by Peter Humphreys, Architecture & Design, the applicant's agent. The letter was read out to the meeting as follows:-

'The proposed development involves the demolition of an old dilapidated corrugated steel 'dutch' barn and the construction of a new annex to a traditional rural property. The new annex will be subservient in scale to the existing house and appropriate in design for its location.

Design

Careful considered thought has been made as to the design, especially with regards to the location and impact of the proposed building in an Area of Outstanding Natural Beauty. The existing 'dutch' style barn is a traditional rural building and it was considered that the proposed new building should also reflect that traditional rural outbuilding ethos. It is intended that the design has the appearance of a converted range of farm outbuildings. Slate Roof, Boarded doors, sliding sash windows and arched salvaged brick lintels. As the existing house is a traditional white painted building it was felt that the proposed building should also reflect this.

Location and Impact

Due to the topography and the fact that the site is surrounded by trees and hedges, the design of the scheme will blend into the landscape and be inconspicuous in its visual impact on the surrounding area. It is not proposed to reduce the site vegetation in any way, so the existing screening of the site will continue. Mr & Mrs King are happy to provide additional screening in the unlikely event that it is deemed necessary.

Background and Need for the Proposal

Mr and Mrs King have owned Tyn Lon since they purchased it 20 years ago, and are well respected throughout the local community. Mr and Mrs King were previously employed for 10 years as Foster Carers, however recently the house, which has previously been extended to accept more foster children, has become too large for them to manage. Mr and Mrs King, therefore recently sold Tyn y Lon, a five bedroom detached house, to their son Dylan and his wife, as they were in desperate need for more space for themselves and their 6 children. This has alleviated the need for the children to continue to share bedrooms and also allows the children the advantage of growing up with space in an environment that is closer to nature. It has also meant that school relocation for the children could also be avoided.

Mr & Mrs King's son Dylan currently works for the Scottish Power contractor IQA, based in Caernarfon, who service and repair the overhead transformer poles, both locally and throughout North Wales. His children attend both Rhosybol Primary and Thomas Jones Schools and are all Welsh and English speakers. Two of the youngest Children were born here and one of the youngest who attends Rhosybol Primary Pre School and is already learning and speaking Welsh. Mr Chris King, Manages his own business, providing Diesel Generators and Generator services to local business, nursing homes,

the Local Authority and domestic users and was previously employed as Pumping Station Manager, Northwest Wales for DCWW Welsh Water.

With Tyn y Lon being surrounded by woodland, infringement on neighbours would be very minimal. Mr & Mrs King have discussed this application with their adjacent neighbours and they are all happy for them to proceed. Mr and Mrs King want to take an active part in their grandchildren's lives, and would like to apply to the Council to build a modest single storey annex next to the house in place of a dilapidated barn which is located next to the house. It would enable the family to continue, the much needed task, of looking after each other, and in the future, the younger family will be able to look after Mr & Mrs King, as they approach our more senior years.'

The Development Management Manager reported that the application is to demolish an existing dutch barn and the erection of a detached self-contained annexe. She noted that the proposed annex is within 4 metres to the existing dwelling at Tyn Lon, Llaneilian. It was reported that there are local concerns as regards to the size and proposed use of the annexe. The Development Management Manager referred to the comments within the correspondence of the Community Council as regards to proposals to erect a detached dwelling and she noted that the Planning Authority has stringent planning policies for the erection of dwellings. She said that this application is for an annexe and a large outbuilding is been demolished to accommodate the annexe. Any permission granted will be subject to a condition that it is only used as an annexe incidental to the existing dwelling. It was further noted that the annexe will share the same access parking and garden area.

Councillor K P Hughes proposed that the application be approved and Councillor Eric W Jones seconded the proposal.

It was RESOLVED to approve the application in accordance with the Officer's recommendation subject to the conditions listed within the written report.

12.7 MAO/2020/16 – Minor amendments to scheme previously approved under planning permission 34/C304K1/EIA/ECON so as to allow development to commence on plot 2 on land at Coleg Menai, Llangefni

Councillors John Griffith and K P Hughes had declared a personal interest in this application and took no part in discussion and voting thereon.

The Development Management Manager reported that a hybrid planning permission for full planning permission for the creation of a new engineering centre, car parking and associated works was approved in 2017 together with an outline permission with some matters reserved for a residential development of 153 dwellings, hotel and food beverage facility along with associated car parking and works on land at Coleg Menai, Llangefni. These new engineering centre has been completed whilst matters relating to the outline consent remain outstanding. However, two separate reserved matters have been submitted in respect of the residential element of the application for

60 dwellings and 91 dwellings and are currently being considered by the Planning Authority. The wording of the conditions attached to the previous permission links all the plots within site B, restricting the ability of certain plots to progress to advance of/or different time to other plots. The current section 96A application therefore seeks non-material amendments to some conditions in relation to the outline consent in order to allow certain plots to progress at separate times to other plots. The Development Management Manager further referred to Condition 42 (set out in the Officer's report) as regards to archaeological works and was part of the outline permission that archaeological works needed to be undertaken at plots 2 and 3 but it is plots 1, 4 and 5 which require archaeological works.

Councillor Robin Williams proposed that the application be approved and Councillor T LI Hughes MBE seconded the proposal.

It was RESOLVED to approve the application in accordance with the Officer's recommendation subject to the conditions listed within the written report.

12.8 FPL/2020/105 – Full application for the construction of additional parking bays at Ffordd Tudur, Holyhead

The application was presented to the Planning and Orders Committee as the application has been submitted by the Housing Department and on Council owned land.

The Development Management Manager reported that the proposal involves creating a total of 21 new parking spaces at Ffordd Tudur, Holyhead. She said that the Committee has visited the area previously as regards to housing development application and she noted that there were local concerns at the time regarding parking and traffic problems in the area. The application is addressing the parking issues in the area on land with no amenity use. The Highways Authority has no objection to the application and the recommendation was of approval of the application.

Councillor T LI Hughes referred that social housing for the elderly is located near the parking bays and he expressed concern that the amenities of the residents will be affected. The Development Management Manager responded that a part of the application a wall is to be erected near the neighbouring properties to mitigate possible light pollution for car headlights.

Councillor Glyn Haynes proposed that the application be approved and Councillor K P Hughes seconded the proposal.

It was RESOLVED to approve the application in accordance with the Officer's recommendation subject to the conditions listed within the written report.

13 OTHER MATTERS

None were considered by this meeting of the Planning and Orders Committee.

**COUNCILLOR RICHARD O JONES
VICE-CHAIR IN THE CHAIR**